



November 30, 2009

Gov. Ed Rendell  
225 Main Capitol  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Speaker Keith McCall  
139 Main Capitol  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Lt. Gov. Joe Scarnati  
200 Main Capitol  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Rep. Jim Roebuck  
208 Irvis Office Building  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Senator Jeff Piccola  
173 Capitol Building  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Rep. Paul Clymer  
216 Ryan Office Building  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Senator Andy Dinniman  
183 Capitol Building  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

RE: Allegations of Intellectual Fraud by PSU Professor

Dear Sirs:

Recently uncovered communications suggest that Penn State University (PSU) associate professor Michael E. Mann, who directs the Earth System Science Center, has withheld and even destroyed (or planned to destroy) scientific evidence that does not support his political agenda. Email among scientists in the Climatic Research Unit (CRU), including Dr. Mann, reveal a level of intellectual fraud that could cost American and Pennsylvania taxpayers trillions of dollars. Dr. Mann has not denied the validity of these correspondences, but argues his comments were taken out of context.

The purpose of my letter is to request that you investigate the compelling allegations of intellectual fraud committed by PSU's Michael Mann before sending another dollar of taxpayer money to the university. While an internal inquiry by PSU is underway, Pennsylvanians would be better protected by an independent, third-party investigation.

What exactly are the allegations? I will summarize them below, and provide references for each.

In correspondence with colleagues over the past five years, Dr. Mann admitted to withholding scientific data to ensure it does not "get into the wrong hands,"<sup>1</sup> said he would screen and delay posting critics' comments on their website,<sup>2</sup> confronted reporters publishing views challenging his,<sup>3</sup> and suggested joining together to ban a journal that published climate change criticism.<sup>4</sup> None of these actions are befitting a

university professor who is supposed to invite dialog and be committed to seeking the truth and going where the evidence leads.

Instead, Dr. Mann continually showed little concern about truth and more about his own political agenda, saying, “we all know, this isn’t about truth at all, its about plausibly deniable accusations”<sup>5</sup> and telling a fellow climate scientist he “screwed up big time” by allowing access to climate data which contradicts his conclusions.<sup>6</sup>

Perhaps more troubling are fellow CRU researcher Phil Jones’ letters regarding Dr. Mann, where he: admits using Mann’s “trick” to “hide the decline” in temperature;<sup>7</sup> advises Mann to delete all emails regarding the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change’s (IPCC) report, hinting they don’t want the Climate Audit to find them;<sup>8</sup> and tells Dr. Mann, he would rather “delete it [station data] than hand it over” to someone who disagrees with his research.<sup>9</sup>

Clearly, these correspondence reveal a serious effort to skew results and even hide problems with the IPCC reports—a serious matter, as the IPCC’s latest report is believed to be the authority on climate change and is significantly influencing legislation in both Washington, D.C. and Harrisburg.

As a taxpayer-funded institution, PSU should foster scientific inquiry and debate, not stifle it. We have serious concerns about what appears to be the use of taxpayer dollars to undermine scientific inquiry for the advancement of a political agenda.

I am writing because I’m sure you too would be appalled if what appear to be intentional acts of intellectual fraud are true. Not only are these alleged acts contrary to the scholarly pursuit of truth, but the costs of such fraud to the taxpayers of Pennsylvania and the United States will be in the trillions of dollars as legislation is pursued and passed based upon faulty and manipulated evidence.

Therefore, as you continue to debate funding for higher education institutions in Pennsylvania, including PSU, I trust that the Rendell Administration, leaders of the General Assembly, and chairmen of the Senate and House Education Committees would thoroughly investigate these apparently inappropriate actions by Dr. Mann; and, if necessary, withhold state funds in response to any failures to adequately address any acts of intellectual fraud committed by Dr. Mann.

I thank you in advance for your attention to this matter, and I look forward to your public addressing of this troubling situation.

Sincerely,

Matthew J. Brouillette  
*President & CEO*

Enclosure

CC: Dr. Graham Spanier, President, Penn State University

## References:

1. Email from Michael Mann to Phil Jones and Gabi Hegerl, August 10, 2004.  
<http://tinyurl.com/yf29qep>.
2. Email from Michael Mann to Tim Osborn and Keith Briffa, February 9, 2006.  
<http://tinyurl.com/yjj2b26>.
3. Email from Michael Mann to Steven Schneider, October 12, 2009.  
<http://tinyurl.com/yktuwsg>.
4. Email from Michael Mann to Phil Jones, February 3, 2005.  
<http://tinyurl.com/yjpqrtwn>.
5. Email from Michael Mann to Phil Jones, October 10, 2009.  
<http://tinyurl.com/y1f9tls>.
6. Email from Michael Mann to Phil Jones, February 2, 2005.  
<http://tinyurl.com/ykgcons>.
7. Email from Phil Jones to Raymond Bradley, Michael Mann and Malcolm Hughes, November 16, 1999. <http://tinyurl.com/ylyrrrk>.
8. Email from Phil Jones to Michael Mann, May 29, 2008.  
<http://tinyurl.com/y19utek>.
9. Email from Phil Jones to Michael Mann, February 2, 2005.  
<http://tinyurl.com/ykgcons>.